UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

ANTHONY DAUNT,

Plaintiff,

 \mathbf{v}

JOCELYN BENSON, JONATHAN BRATER, SHERYL GUY, DAWN OLNEY, CHERYL POTTER BROWE, KAREN BREWSTER, SUANNE KANINE, BONNIE SCHEELE, NANCY HEUBEL, DEBORAH HILL, JULIE A. CARLSON, MICHELLE CROCKER, ELIZABETH HUNDLEY, LORI JOHNSON, LISA BROWN, SUSAN I. DEFEYTER, MICHELLE STEVENSON, and LAWRENCE KESTENBAUM,

No. 1:20-cy-00522

HON. ROBERT J. JONKER

DEFENDANTS SECRETARY OF STATE JOCELYN BENSON AND DIRECTOR OF ELECTIONS JONATHAN BRATER'S MOTION TO DISMISS

Defendants.

William S. Consovoy Cameron T. Norris Tiffany H. Bates Attorneys for Plaintiff 1600 Wilson Blvd, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22209

Jason Torchinsky Attorney for Plaintiff 45 North Hill Drive, Ste 100 Warrenton, VA 20186 540.341.8800

Elizabeth R. Husa Briggs (P73907) Heather S. Meingast (P55439) Erik A. Grill (P64713) Attorneys for Defendants Benson & Brater PO Box 30736 Lansing, Michigan 48909 517.335.7659

Joellen Shortley (P46136) Attorney for Defendant Brown 1200 N. Telegraph, Dept 419, Bldg 14E Pontiac, Michigan 48341 248.420.7639 David G. Stoker (P24959)
Timothy M. Perrone (P37940)
Courtney Ann Gabbara (P77817)
Attorneys for Defendants Crocker, Hill,
Heubel, Hundley, Johnson, Kestenbaum,
Olney, Scheele
601 North Capitol Avenue
Lansing, Michigan 48933
517.372.9000

Haider A. Kazim (P66146) Attorney for Defendants Browe, Carlson, DeFeyter, Guy, Kanine, Stevenson 310 W. Front St, Ste 221 Traverse City, Michigan 49684 231.922.1888

Brandon K. Buck (P63152) Attorney for Defendant Brown 28400 Northwestern Hwy, 2nd Fl. Southfield, Michigan 48034 248.858.8677

DEFENDANTS SECRETARY OF STATE JOCELYN BENSON AND DIRECTOR OF ELECTIONS JONATHAN BRATER'S MOTION TO DISMISS

Defendants Secretary of State Jocelyn Benson and Director of Elections Jonathan Brater, by counsel, move this Court to dismiss Plaintiff's complaint under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6), for the reasons identified below and explained in detail in their supporting brief.

Dismissal is necessary under Rule 12(b)(1) because the factual allegations in the complaint, even if true, do not demonstrate standing with respect to the claims asserted. Standing is a threshold issue, indispensable to availing oneself of Court's jurisdiction. Having failed to provide sufficient factual allegations supporting this, Plaintiff's complaint must be dismissed.

Dismissal is also warranted under Rule 12(b)(6) because the factual allegations in the complaint, even if true, are insufficient to allege a claim of vote dilution. And the requested preliminary injunctive relief is contrary to law. Specifically, the National Voter Registration Act, 52 U.S.C. § 20507, requires a state to complete any program for systematic removal of potentially ineligible voters more than ninety (90) days before the federal election. The date of the next federal election is November 3, 2020 – fewer than sixty (60) days away. Even if Plaintiff had, or could, demonstrate that Michigan's list-maintenance procedures are insufficient under the NVRA, his request for preliminary relief prior to the upcoming election is contrary to federal law.

Accordingly, for the reasons explained above and in their supporting brief, Defendants Secretary Benson and Director Brater respectfully request this Court dismiss Plaintiff's complaint in its entirety and grant such other relief as it deems just and proper.

Respectfully submitted,

DANA NESSEL Attorney General

s/Elizabeth R. Husa Briggs

Elizabeth R. Husa Briggs (P73907)
Heather S. Meingast (P55439)
Erik A. Grill (P64713)
Assistant Attorneys General
Attorneys for Defendant
P.O. Box 30736
Lansing, Michigan 48909
517.335.7659
Email: briggsel@michigan.gov
(P73907)

Dated: September 14, 2020

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on September 14, 2020, I electronically filed the foregoing paper with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF system which will send notification of such filing of the foregoing document as well as via US Mail to all non-ECF participants.

s/Elizabeth Husa Briggs

Elizabeth R. Husa Briggs (P73907) P.O. Box 30736 Lansing, Michigan 48909 517.335.7659

Email: <u>briggsel@michigan.gov</u>

P73907