IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

JOSEPH DRENTH and NATIONAL : FEDERATION OF THE BLIND OF : PENNSYLVANIA, :

Plaintiffs: No. 1:20-0829

:

v. : Judge Wilson

:

KATHY BOOCKVAR and : Electronically Filed Document

DEPARTMENT OF STATE OF THE :

COMMONWEALTH OF :

PENNSYLVANIA, :

Defendants : Complaint Filed 05/21/20

MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE REGARDING THE ACCESSIBLE WRITE-IN BALLOT

Kathy Boockvar, Secretary of the Commonwealth in her official capacity, and the Department of State of Pennsylvania ("Defendants"), by and through their undersigned counsel, hereby submit this Motion *in Limine* to Exclude Evidence Regarding the Accessible Write-In Ballot, as follows.

1. Plaintiffs initiated this action on May 21, 2020, filing a Complaint against the Defendants, simultaneously with a Motion for Temporary Restraining Order (TRO), alleging that the Defendants' absentee and mail-in voting programs are inaccessible in violation of Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act (RA). Docs. 1-5.

- 2. Following a hearing on the TRO related to ballot accessibility for the June 2, 2020 Primary Election, the Court entered an Order directing the temporary solution of the Accessible Write-In-Ballot (AWIB).
- 3. This case is now proceeding on Plaintiffs' request for "...a permanent injunction...requiring Defendants to remedy their absentee and mail-in ballot system by implementing a remote accessible vote-by-mail system for Plaintiffs and those similarly situated for all future elections." Doc. 1, ¶ 118.
- 4. The Defendants are already implementing a Remote Ballot Marking System (RBMS) for the delivery and marking of ballots for blind voters. *See* doc. $51, \P 1$.
- 5. The Accessible Write-In Ballot (AWIB) was a temporary solution that will never be used again, particularly because of the availability of an RBMS.
- 6. It is anticipated that the Plaintiffs will seek to introduce evidence regarding the brief history, use, and voters' purported experiences with the AWIB.
- 7. Evidence regarding the AWIB is irrelevant under Federal Rule of Evidence 401 because it does not make a consequential fact more or less probable. A new RBMS system will be in place for the November 2020 General Election, and facts about the AWIB will not be germane to this sophisticated ballot delivery and marking system.

8. To the extent that there is probative value in evidence of the AWIB (which is denied), it is substantially outweighed by considerations including unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, and wasting time, rendering the evidence properly excluded under Federal Rule of Evidence 403.

WHEREFORE, Defendants request that this Honorable Court grant this Motion and exclude all evidence regarding the AWIB.

Respectfully submitted,

JOSH SHAPIRO **Attorney General**

By: s/Nicole J. Boland

NICOLE J. BOLAND **Deputy Attorney General Attorney ID 314061**

Office of Attorney General 15th Floor, Strawberry Square Harrisburg, PA 17120 Phone: (717) 783-3146 KAREN M. ROMANO

nboland@attorneygeneral.gov

Chief Deputy Attorney General Civil Litigation Section

Counsel for Defendants **Date: August 3, 2020**

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

JOSEPH DRENTH and NATIONAL : FEDERATION OF THE BLIND OF : PENNSYLVANIA, :

Plaintiffs: No. 1:20-0829

:

v. : Judge Wilson

:

KATHY BOOCKVAR and : Electronically Filed Document

DEPARTMENT OF STATE OF THE :

COMMONWEALTH OF :

PENNSYLVANIA, :

Defendants: Complaint Filed 05/21/20

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Nicole J. Boland, Deputy Attorney General for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Office of Attorney General, hereby certify that on August 3, 2020, I caused to be served a true and correct copy of the foregoing document to the following:

VIA ECF

Kelly Darr, Esquire
Robin Resnick, Esquire
Disability Rights Pennsylvania
1800 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Suite 900
Philadelphia, PA 19103
kdarr@disabilityrightspa.org
rresnick@disabilityrightspa.org
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Kobie A. Flowers, Esquire
James O. Strawbridge, Esquire
Sharon M. Krevor-Weisbaum, Esquire
Brown Goldstein & Levy, LLP
120 East Baltimore Street
Suite 1700
Baltimore, MD 21202
kflowers@browngold.com
jstrawbridge@browngold.com
skw@browngold.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs

s/Nicole J. Boland
NICOLE J. BOLAND
Deputy Attorney General

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

JOSEPH DRENTH and NATIONAL : FEDERATION OF THE BLIND OF : PENNSYLVANIA, :

Plaintiffs: No. 1:20-0829

:

v. : Judge Wilson

•

KATHY BOOCKVAR and : Electronically Filed Document

DEPARTMENT OF STATE OF THE:

COMMONWEALTH OF :

PENNSYLVANIA, :

Defendants : Complaint Filed 05/21/20

CERTIFICATE OF NON-CONCURRENCE

Undersigned counsel contacted counsel for the Plaintiffs, who does not concur in this Motion.

s/ Nicole J. Boland NICOLE J. BOLAND

Deputy Attorney General