Supreme Court of Ohio Clerk of Court - Filed January 31, 2022 - Case No. 2021-1198

Supreme Court of Phio

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF OHIO, et al., :

:

Relators, : Case No. 2021-1193

:

v. : Original Action Pursuant to

Ohio Const., Art. XI

OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al.,

Apportionment Case

Respondents.

:

BRIA BENNETT, et al.,

.

Relators, : Case No. 2021-1198

v. : Original Action Pursuant to

: Ohio Const., Art. XI

OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al.,

Apportionment Case

Respondents.

v.

:

OHIO ORGANIZING COLLABORATIVE, et al.,

C N 2024

Relators, : Case No. 2021-1210

: Original Action Pursuant to : Ohio Const., Art. XI

OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al.,

: Apportionment Case

Respondents.

MOTION FOR LIMITED INTERVENTION BY ATTORNEY GENERAL & MOTION TO CONVERT "RESPONSE" TO AMICI BRIEF

DAVE YOST Ohio Attorney General

CHARLES MILLER* (0073844) Counsel to the Attorney General SHAWN BUSKEN (0083585) Director of Outside Counsel

*Counsel of Record

30 East Broad Street, 17th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 513.607.0406 Charles.Miller@OhioAGO.gov

Counsel for Limited Intervenor Attorney General Dave Yost

Freda J. Levenson* (0045916)

*Counsel of Record

ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
4506 Chester Avenue

Cleveland, Ohio 44103
614.586.1972. x125
flevenson@acluohio.org

David J. Carey (0088787) ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC. 1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203 Columbus, Ohio 43206 614.586.1972. x2004 dcarey@aclu.org

T. Alora Thomas (PHV 22010)
Julie A. Ebenstein (PHV 25423)
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
125 Broad Street
New York, New York 10004
212.519.7866.
athomas@aclu.org
jebenstein@aclu.org

Robert D. Fram (PHV 25414-2021) Joshua Gonzalez (PHV 25424-2021) Juliana Goldrosen (PHV 25193-2021) David Denuyl (PHV 25452-2021) Donald Brown (PHV 25480-2021) COVINGTON & BURLING LLP Dave Yost Ohio Attorney General

Erik J. Clark* (0078732)

*Counsel of Record

Ashley T. Merino (0096853)

ORGAN LAW LLP

1330 Dublin Road

Columbus, Ohio 43215

614.481.0900

614.481.0904 (facsimile)

ejclark@organlegal.com

amerino@organlegal.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General Dave Yost

Counsel for Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission

Dave Yost Ohio Attorney General

Bridget C. Coontz (0072919)

*Counsel of Record

Julie M. Pfeiffer (006762)

Michael A. Walton (0092201)

Michael J. Hendershot (0081842)

OFFICE OF THE OHIO ATTORNEY

GENERAL

30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor

Salesforce Tower
415 Mission Street, Suite 5400
San Francisco, California 94105-2533
415.591.6000
rfram@cov.com
JGonzalez@cov.com
jgoldrosen@cov.com
ddenuyl@cov.com

dwbrown@cov.com

ajthomson@cov.com

Megan C. Keenan (PHV 25410-2021)
Laura B. Bender (PHV 25192-2021)
Alexander Thomson (PHV 25462-2021)
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
850 Tenth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20001-4956
202.662.6000
mkeenan@cov.com
jmsmith@cov.com
bbender@cov.com

Anupam Sharma (PHV 25418-2021)
James Hovard (PHV 25420-2021)
Yiye Fu (PHV 25419-2021)
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
3000 El Camino Real
5 Palo Alto, Square, 10th Floor
Palo Alto, California 94306-2112
650.632.4700
650.632.4800 (facsimile)
asharma@cov.com
jhovard@cov.com
yfu@cov.com

Counsel for Relators League of Women Voters of Ohio, et al., in Case No. 2012-1193

Donald J. McTigue (0022849) *Counsel of Record

Columbus, Ohio 43215 614.466.2872 614.782.7592 (facsimile) Bridget.Coontz@OhioAGO.gov

Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov Michael.Hendershot@OhioAGO.gov

Counsel for Respondents Ohio Governor DeWine, Ohio Secretary of State LaRose, and Ohio Auditor Faber

W. Stuart Dornette (0002955)
Beth A. Bryan (0082076)
Philip D. Williamson (0097174)
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP
425 Walnut St., Suite 1800
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-3957
513.381.2838
513.381.0205 (facsimile)
dornette@taftlaw.com
bryan@taftlaw.com
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

Phillip J. Strach (PHV 2544-2021) Thomas A. Farr (PHV 25461) John E. Branch, III (PHV 25460) Alyssa M. Riggins (PHV 25441-2021) Greg McGuire (PHV 25483) **NELSON MULLINS RILEY &** SCARBOROUGH LLP 4140 Parklake Avenue, Suite 200 Raleigh, North Carolina 27612 919.329.3800 919.329.3799 (facsimile) phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com john.branch@nelsonmullins.com alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

Derek S. Clinger (0092075)
MCTIGUE & COLOMBO LLC
545 East Town Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
614.263.7000
614.368.6961 (facsimile)
dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com
dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

Aria C. Branch (PHV 25435-2021)
Jyoti Jasrasaria (PHV 25401-2021)
Spencer W. Klein (PHV 25432-2021)
ELIAS LAW GROUP
10 G St NE, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20002
202.968.4490
202.968.4498 (facsimile)
abranch@elias.law
jjasrasaria@elias.law
sklein@elias.law

Abha Khanna (PHV 2189-2021)
William B. Stafford (PHV 25433-2021)
ELIAS LAW GROUP
1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100
Seattle, Washington 98101
206.656.0176
206.656.0180 (facsimile)
akhanna@elias.law
bstafford@elias.law

Counsel for Relators Bria Bennett, et al., in Case No. 2021-1198

Peter M. Ellis (0070264)

*Counsel of Record

M. Patrick Yingling (PHV 10145-2021)

Natalie R. Salazar

REED SMITH LLP

Counsel for Respondents Matt Huffman, President of the Ohio Senate, and Robert R. Cupp, Speaker of the Ohio House of Representatives

Minority Leader Allison Russo (*pro se*) Allison.russo@ohiohouse.gov Rep24@ohiohouse.gov

Senator Vernon Sykes (*pro se*) sd28@ohiosenate.gov

10 South Wacker Drive, 40th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60606 312.207.1000 312.207.6400 (facsimile) pellis@reedsmith.com mpyingling@reedsmith.com nsalazar@reedsmith.com

Alicia L. Bannon (PHV 25409-2021)
Yurij Rudensky (PHV 25422-2021)
Michael Li (PHV 25430-2021)
Ethan Herenstein (PHV 25429-2021)
BRENNAN CENTER FOR JUSTICE
AT NYU SCHOOL OF LAW
120 Broadway, Suite 1750
New York, New York 10271
646.292.8310
212.463.7308 (facsimile)
alicia.bannon@nyu.edu
rudenskyy@brennan.law.nyu.edu
herensteine@brennan.law.nyu.edu

Ben R. Fliegel (PHV 25411-2021) REED SMITH LLP 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900 Los Angeles, California 90071 213.457.8000 213.457.8080 (facsimile) bfliegel@reedsmith.com

Brad A. Funari (PHV 3139-2021) Danielle L. Stewart (0084086) REED SMITH LLP 225 Fifth Avenue Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222 412.288.4583 412.288.3063 (facsimile) bfunari@reedsmith.com dstewart@reedsmith.com Brian A. Sutherland (PHV 25406-2021) REED SMITH LLP 101 Second Street, Suite 1800 San Francisco, California 94105 415.543.8700 415.391.8269 (facsimile) bsutherland@reedsmith.com

Counsel for Relators Ohio Organizing Collaborative, et al., in Case No. 2021-1210

MOTION

Ohio Attorney General Dave Yost moves, pursuant to S.Ct.Prac.R. 4.01 and Civil R. 24 (incorporated into Original Actions by S.Ct.Prac.R. 12.01(A)(2)(b)), to intervene in for the limited purpose of filing this motion, which seeks to convert the January 28, 2022 "Response of respondents Senator Vernon Sykes and House Minority Leader Allison Russo to the petitioners' objections" ("Response") into an *amici curiae* filing.

As the Response itself thoroughly details, the Attorney General decided that only the Redistricting Commission itself should respond to the Petitioners' Objections. No individual member was authorized to file in their official capacity. The Republican Statewide Office Holders were denied the right to file official separate responses. So were both legislative factions—Republican and Democrat alike. The actions of the Commission as a body were the subject of the Objections—not the separate actions of any individual member. Accordingly, as more fully discussed below, the Attorney General, as the Chief Law Officer of the State of Ohio, deemed that a single response was in order.

Of course, this Court regularly accepts filings by *amici curiae*. The self-described "pro se" filing is better categorized as an amicus filing by the individuals in their personal capacities. *See*, *e.g.*, S.Ct.Prac.R. 16.06. As such, the Attorney General requests he be permitted limited intervention to protect his powers as Chief Law Officer of the State of Ohio, and that the Response be deemed an amicus brief. *Derolph v. State*, 2001-Ohio-5092, 94 Ohio St. 3d 40, 43, 760 N.E.2d 351, 354; *See also*, *Id.* at 47-48, 357 (Cook, J., dissenting).

LIMITED STATEMENT OF RELEVANT FACTS

The Response was, as admitted by the filers, an unauthorized filing on behalf of a State entity. In response to the Court's Order, and subsequent Objections, no individual member of the Commission – Republican or Democrat – has been permitted to make an individual filing. The Commission speaks through its official actions and through its votes. Accordingly, Counsel to the Commission is the only counsel permitted to represent the Commission to respond to Petitioners' Objections.

Respondents Allison Russo and Vernon Sykes filed the *pro se* Response, asserting they were *denied* legal counsel in this proceeding. This is false. At all relevant times, the minority members of the Commission have had counsel. At their earlier request, the Attorney General assigned the then Democrat members of the Commission (prior to Commissioner Russo's substitution as a member) the outside counsel they requested—Ice Miller.

On Thursday, January 27, 2022, Respondents requested that their appointed counsel, Ice Miller, withdraw as counsel. On Friday January 28, 2022, Ice Miller complied with the request. Upon that withdrawal, Respondents Allison Russo and Vernon Sykes were still represented by counsel – the Attorney General's Office, their statutory counsel under R.C. §109.361. Indeed, a specific Assistant Attorney General, walled off from other in-house attorneys, was specifically tasked with representing Russo and Sykes should they have decided not to engage outside counsel. Importantly,

the "8(C) Minority Report" of Commissioners Sykes and Russo is of record with this court, setting forth their position.¹

The filers of the *pro se* Response knew and acknowledged that the Attorney

General decided that only the Redistricting Commission, and no individual

Commissioner would be authorized to file an official response on behalf of the State or any of its components. The *pro se* filers elected to proceed independently. As such,

Respondents' Response, agreeing with Petitioners' Objections, should have been filed in the form of an amicus brief.

ARGUMENT

The Attorney General is the Chief Law Officer of the State of Ohio. R.C. §109.02. "[N]o state officer or board, or head of a department or institution of the state shall employ, or be represented by, other counsel or attorneys at law. The attorney general shall appear for the state in the trial and argument of all civil and criminal causes in the supreme court in which the state is directly or indirectly interested." *Id.* The decisions of how to afford legal counsel, and how to conduct litigation, are within the control of the Attorney General. *Accord, Bd. of Trs. of the Tobacco Use Prevention & Control Found. v. Boyce*, 2010-Ohio-6207, ¶ 29, 127 Ohio St. 3d 511, 518, 941 N.E.2d 745, 753 (rejecting State

¹ A copy of the Minority Report is available as Exhibit 11 to the Commission's Response (Jan 28, 2022).

Board's argument that the Attorney General "sabotaged" the board by declining to provide legal counsel for an executive session).

In the waning days of the *DeRolph* litigation, this Court ruled on the Attorney General's objection to the participation of certain State actor *amici* in court ordered mediation, citing the above law. This Court responded: "We acknowledge the import of these statutory provisions. What is surprising, however, is that the Attorney General in her November 26 response acknowledges that the counsel who have represented two Governors and four leaders of the houses of the General Assembly over the course of this appeal were not appointed special counsel pursuant to this statutory authority. She had not, however, objected before November 26 to the representation of any elected official as an amicus curiae by private counsel or rebutted the inference that the counsel had been appointed special counsel." DeRolph, 94 Ohio St.3d, at 42. The majority concluded, "The Attorney General has failed to timely object to numerous elected officials' appearing as amici in their official capacities," and found the argument waived. *Id.* at 43. The *DeRolph* majority recognizes the Attorney General's right to control State litigation, and thus, the need for his limited intervention here. Also here, the Attorney General has objected the very day after the unauthorized filing. Thus, there has been no waiver.

The dissent in *DeRolph* did not find waiver, and thus, reached the merits. Its analysis is informative here. "The majority does not explicitly find that the Attorney

General is wrong to seek to exclude the amici from settlement proceedings based on the status of those individuals. Rather, the majority contends that it is simply too late to object to the involvement of the amici to keep them from the negotiating table. But nowhere does the law accord amici the status of parties." Id. at 48 (Cook, J., dissenting). The dissent concluded, "To treat the amici as if they were parties ignores this court's own rules and law on the subject." *Id.* Where the majority and the dissent agree is that had the Attorney General timely asserted her right (the then Attorney General was female) to control litigation, she would have prevailed.

Of course, under Ohio law, dissenting members of a board or legislative body lack standing to challenge the action in their official capacity. *See ProgressOhio.org, Inc. v. JobsOhio*, 2012-Ohio-2655, ¶ 28, 973 N.E.2d 307, 316 (10th Dist.), ("The [Supreme] court indicated that a legislator voting in the minority would not have standing"), *citing State ex rel. Ohio Gen. Assembly v. Brunner*, 114 Ohio St.3d 386, 2007 Ohio 3780, ¶¶ 17-19, 20, 872 N.E.2d 912.

To do anything other than grant this motion will cause this Court (and others in the future) to be flooded with multiple, competing filings offering the purported legal positions of the State, or components thereof, thereby depriving the Attorney General of his longstanding statutory and inherent power to ensure the State speaks with one voice—or multiple voices only when so authorized. Granting this motion "serves to prevent the judicial process from being used to usurp the powers of the political

branches" by granting official governmental standing to a person who does not hold it. *Hollingsworth v. Perry*, 570 U.S. 693, 704-05, 133 S. Ct. 2652, 2661 (2013) Accordingly, the *pro se* filing should be treated as an amicus filing. *State ex rel. Citizen Action v. Hamilton Cty. Bd. of Elections*, 2007-Ohio-5379, ¶ 24, 115 Ohio St. 3d 437, 440, 875 N.E.2d 902, 906 ("Although we have denied the city's motion to intervene for the reasons previously set forth, the city is entitled to file an amicus curiae brief without leave of court.")

Dated: January 31, 2022 Respectfully submitted,

DAVE YOST Ohio Attorney General

/s/Charles M. Miller
CHARLES MILLER* (0073844)
Counsel to the Attorney General
*Counsel of Record
SHAWN BUSKEN (0083585)
Director of Outside Counsel
30 East Broad Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
513.607.0406
Charles.Miller@OhioAGO.gov

Counsel for Limited Intervenor Attorney General Dave Yost

6

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that on January 31, 2022, a copy of the

foregoing was served by electronic mail upon the following:

Freda J. Levenson*
*Counsel of Record
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
4506 Chester Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44103
614.586.1972. x125

flevenson@acluohio.org

David J. Carey
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203
Columbus, Ohio 43206
614.586.1972. x2004
dcarey@aclu.org

Alora Thomas
Julie A. Ebenstein
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
125 Broad Street
New York, New York 10004
212.519.7866.
athomas@aclu.org
jebenstein@aclu.org

Robert D. Fram
Joshua Gonzalez
Juliana Goldrosen
David Denuyl
Donald Brown
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
415 Mission Street, Suite 5400
San Francisco, California 94105-2533
rfram@cov.com

Erik J. Clark*

*Counsel of Record

Ashley T. Merino
ORGAN LAW LLP
1330 Dublin Road
Columbus, Ohio 43215
614.481.0900
614.481.0904 (facsimile)
ejclark@organlegal.com
amerino@organlegal.com

*Counsel of Record
Julie M. Pfeiffer
Michael A. Walton
Michael J. Hendershot
OFFICE OF THE OHIO ATTORNEY
GENERAL
30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
614.466.2872
614.782.7592 (facsimile)
Bridget.Coontz@OhioAGO.gov
Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov
Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov

Counsel for Respondents Ohio Governor DeWine, Ohio Secretary of State LaRose, and Ohio Auditor Faber

Michael.Henderson@OhioAGO.gov

JGonzalez@cov.com jgoldrosen@cov.com ddenuyl@cov.com dwbrown@cov.com

Megan C. Keenan James Smith L. Brady Bender Alexander Thomson

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

One CityCenter 850 Tenth Street, NW

Washington, DC 20001-4956

202.662.6000

mkeenan@cov.com jmsmith@cov.com bbender@cov.com ajthomson@cov.com

Anupam Sharma James Hovard Yiye Fu

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

3000 El Camino Real

5 Palo Alto, Square, 10th Floor Palo Alto, California 94306-2112

650.632.4700

asharma@cov.com jhovard@cov.com yfu@cov.com

Counsel for Relators League of Women Voters of Ohio, et al., in Case No. 2021-1193

W. Stuart Dornette Beth A. Bryan

Philip D. Williamson

TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP

425 Walnut St., Suite 1800 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-3957

513.381.2838

513.381.0205 (facsimile) dornette@taftlaw.com bryan@taftlaw.com

pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

Phillip J. Strach Thomas A. Farr John E. Branch, III Alyssa M. Riggins Greg McGuire

NELSON MULLINS RILEY &

SCARBOROUGH LLP

4140 Parklake Avenue, Suite 200 Raleigh, North Carolina 27612

919.329.3800

919.329.3799 (facsimile)

phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com john.branch@nelsonmullins.com alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

Counsel for Respondents Matt Huffman, President of the Ohio Senate, and Robert R.

Cupp, Speaker of the Ohio House of

Representatives

Donald J. McTigue

Counsel of Record

Derek S. Clinger

MCTIGUE & COLOMBO LLC

545 East Town Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 614.263.7000 614.368.6961 (facsimile) dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

Aria C. Branch
Jyoti Jasrasaria
Spencer W. Klein
ELIAS LAW GROUP
10 G St NE, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20002
202.968.4490
202.968.4498 (facsimile)
abranch@elias.law
jjasrasaria@elias.law
sklein@elias.law

Abha Khanna William B. Stafford ELIAS LAW GROUP 1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100 Seattle, Washington 98101 206.656.0176 206.656.0180 (facsimile) akhanna@elias.law bstafford@elias.law

Counsel for Relators Bria Bennett, et al., in Case No. 2021-1198

Peter M. Ellis*

*Counsel of Record

M. Patrick Yingling

Natalie R. Salazar

REED SMITH LLP

10 South Wacker Drive, 40th Floor

Chicago, Illinois 60606

312.207.1000

312.207.6400 (facsimile) pellis@reedsmith.com mpyingling@reedsmith.com nsalazar@reedsmith.com

Alicia L. Bannon
Yurij Rudensky
Michael Li
Ethan Herenstein
BRENNAN CENTER FOR JUSTICE
AT NYU SCHOOL OF LAW
120 Broadway, Suite 1750
New York, New York 10271
646.292.8310
212.463.7308 (facsimile)
alicia.bannon@nyu.edu
rudenskyy@brennan.law.nyu.edu
herensteine@brennan.law.nyu.edu

Ben R. Fliegel REED SMITH LLP 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900 Los Angeles, California 90071 213.457.8000 213.457.8080 (facsimile) bfliegel@reedsmith.com

Brad A. Funari
Danielle L. Stewart
REED SMITH LLP
225 Fifth Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222
412.288.4583
412.288.3063 (facsimile)
bfunari@reedsmith.com
dstewart@reedsmith.com

Brian A. Sutherland REED SMITH LLP 101 Second Street, Suite 1800 San Francisco, California 94105 415.543.8700 415.391.8269 (facsimile) bsutherland@reedsmith.com

Counsel for Relators Ohio Organizing Collaborative, et al., in Case No. 2021-1210

Minority Leader Allison Russo Allison.russo@ohiohouse.gov Rep24@ohiohouse.gov

Senator Vernon Sykes sd28@ohiosenate.gov

/s/ Charles Miller

Charles M. Miller