1	KRISTIN K. MAYES ATTORNEY GENERAL			
2	Hayleigh S. Crawford (No. 032326)			
3	Joshua M. Whitaker (No. 032724) Robert J. Makar (No. 033579)			
4	Assistant Attorneys General 2005 N. Central Avenue			
5	Phoenix, Arizona 85004 Telephone: (602) 542-5200			
6				
7	Email: Robert.Makar@azag.gov			
8	FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. Douglas C. Northup (No. 013987)			
9				
10	2394 E. Camelback Road, Suite 600 Phoenix, Arizona 85016			
11	Telephone: (602) 916-5000 Email: dnorthup@fennemorelaw.com			
12	Email: tberg@fennemorelaw.com Email: eward@fennemorelaw.com			
13	Attorneys for Defendant			
14	Attorney General Kristin K. Mayes			
15	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT			
16	DISTRICT OF ARIZONA			
17	Mi Familia Vota, et al.,	No. CV-22-00509-PHX-SRB (Lead)		
18	Plaintiffs,	DEFENDANT ATTORNEY GENERAL KRISTIN K. MAYES'S		
19	V.	ANSWER TO AMENDED		
20	Adrian Fontes, et al.,	PLAINTIFFS TOHONO O'ODHAM NATION ET AL.		
21	Defendants.	NATION ET AL.		
22	THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:	No. CV-22-01901-PHX-SRB		
23		No. CV-22-01901-PHA-SRB		
24	Defendant Attorney General Kristin K. Mayes (the "Attorney General") answers the			
25	Amended Complaint filed by Plaintiffs Tohono O'odham Nation, Gila River Indian			
26	Community, Keanu Stevens, Alanna Siquieros, and La Donna Jacket (collectively,			
27	"Plaintiffs") on December 9, 2022 in Case No. CV-22-01901-PHX-SRB as follows:			
28				

1 INTRODUCTION 2 1. The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of 3 their claims in this action. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in 4 Paragraph 1. 2. 5 The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of 6 their claims in this action. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in 7 Paragraph 2. 8 3. The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of 9 their claims in this action. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in 10 Paragraph 3. 11 4. The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of 12 their claims in this action. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in 13 Paragraph 4. 14 5. The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of 15 their claims in this action. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in 16 Paragraph 5. 17 **JURISDICTION AND VENUE** 18 6. The Attorney General admits that the Court has subject matter jurisdiction. 19 7. Admit. 20 **PARTIES** 21 *Plaintiffs* 22 8. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the 23 allegations in Paragraph 8 and therefore denies the same. 24 9. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the 25 allegations in Paragraph 9 and therefore denies the same. 26 10. The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of 27 Plaintiff Tohono O'odham Nation's claims in this action but denies any allegations that HB 28 2492 violates the U.S. Constitution or federal law.

- 11. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 11 and therefore denies the same.
- 12. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 12 and therefore denies the same.
- 13. The Attorney General admits that Plaintiffs generally describe the nature of Plaintiff Gila River Indian Community's claims in this action but denies any allegations that HB 2492 violates the U.S. Constitution or federal law.
- 14. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 14 and therefore denies the same.
- 15. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 15 and therefore denies the same.
- 16. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 16 and therefore denies the same.
- 17. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 17 and therefore denies the same.
- 18. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 18 and therefore denies the same.
- 19. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 19 and therefore denies the same.
- 20. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 20 and therefore denies the same.
- 21. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 21 and therefore denies the same.
- 22. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 22 and therefore denies the same.

#### Defendants

23. The Attorney General admits that the Secretary of State "serves as the chief state election officer for Arizona" and that he has related statutory authority. The specific

laws identified in Paragraph 23 speak for themselves, and the Attorney General denies any allegations inconsistent with those laws.

- 24. The Attorney General admits that the Arizona Attorney General is the "State's chief legal officer," that she is authorized to enforce certain election laws, and that she has related statutory authority. The specific laws identified in Paragraph 24 speak for themselves, and the Attorney General denies any allegations inconsistent with those laws.
- 25. The Attorney General admits that the county recorders are "election officers at the local level" and that they have related statutory authority in implementing registration of voters and maintaining voter rolls, but she lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 25 and therefore denies the same.

#### FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 26. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 26 and therefore denies the same.
- 27. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 27 and therefore denies the same.

# Current mechanism for specifying residence location

- 28. The Attorney General admits that, under Arizona law, voter registration applicants provide their residence address or location. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the "purpose" of the law as described in Paragraph 28 and therefore denies the same.
  - 29. Admit.
  - 30. Admit.
- 31. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 31 and therefore denies the same.

# Documentary proof of location of residence requirement in HB 2492

32. The Attorney General admits that Arizona passed H.B. 2492, which includes a proof of residence requirement. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in Paragraph 32.

- 33. The Attorney General admits that the documents prescribed in A.R.S. § 16-579(A)(1) are sufficient proof of location of residence, but deny that these are the only documents that may constitute such proof.
- 34. The Attorney General admits that certain documents are sufficient proof of location of residence, but denies that these are the only documents that may constitute such proof, and further denies the description of HB 2492 as a "Physical Address Requirement."
- 35. The Attorney General admits that A.R.S. § 16-121.01 refers to registration forms that contain "the residence address or the location" of the applicant. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny any remaining allegations in Paragraph 35 and therefore denies the same.

#### Tohono O'odham Nation

- 36. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 36 and therefore denies the same.
- 37. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 37 and therefore denies the same.
- 38. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 38 and therefore denies the same.
  - 39. Deny.
- 40. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 40 and therefore denies the same.
- 41. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 41 and therefore denies the same.
- 42. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 42 and therefore denies the same.

# Gila River Indian Community

- 43. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 43 and therefore denies the same.
- 44. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary for satisfying the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 44 and therefore denies the same.
- 45. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary for satisfying the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 45 and therefore denies the same.
- 46. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary for satisfying the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 46 and therefore denies the same.
- 47. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 47 and therefore denies the same.
- 48. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 48 and therefore denies the same.
- 49. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary for satisfying the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 49 and therefore denies the same.

# **Hopi Indian Reservation**

- 50. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in Paragraph 50 and therefore denies the same.
- 51. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 51 and therefore denies the same.
- 52. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 52 and therefore denies the same.

53. The Attorney General denies that a physical address is necessary to satisfy the DPOR requirement. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 53 and therefore denies the same.

#### Enactment of HB 2492's Physical Address Requirement

- 54. The Attorney General alleges that the quoted statements speak for themselves and further denies any allegations contained in this paragraph that are inconsistent with or otherwise mischaracterize their language. The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny all remaining allegations in Paragraph 54 and therefore denies the same.
- 55. The Attorney General denies the description of HB 2492 as a "Physical Address Requirement." The Attorney General lacks sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph 55 and therefore denies the same.
  - 56. Admit.
  - 57. Deny.

# **CLAIMS FOR RELIEF**

#### COUNT 1

#### National Voter Registration Act Section 6, 52 U.S.C. § 20505 Failure to Accept and Use Federal Form (On Behalf of All Plaintiffs and as to All Defendants)

- 58. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a response is required, the Attorney General admits the quoted language is accurately reproduced.
- 59. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a response is required, the Attorney General admits that in *Arizona v. Inter Tribal Council of Ariz., Inc.*, 570 U.S. 1 (2013), the Supreme Court held that the NVRA preempted a certain application of Arizona law. The Court's opinion speaks for itself, and the Attorney General denies any allegations in Paragraph 59 inconsistent with the opinion.

- 60. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a response is required, the Attorney General admits that the quoted material is accurately reproduced.
- 61. The Attorney General admits that the "Federal Form directs people that live in rural areas and that do not have a street address to show where they live by filling in a map." The Attorney General denies the remaining allegations in Paragraph 61.
- 62. The Attorney General admits that, under HB 2492, the DPOR requirement applies to all Arizona registrations including for federal elections.
- 63. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response at this time. If a response is required at this time, the Attorney General denies the allegations in Paragraph 63.
- 64. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a response is required, the Attorney General admits that the quoted material is accurately reproduced.
  - 65. Deny.
- 66. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response at this time. If a response is required at this time, the Attorney General denies the allegations in Paragraph 66.
  - 67. Deny.

### COUNT 2

# First and Fourteenth Amendment of the U.S. Constitution; 42 U.S.C. § 1983 Severe and Unjustifiable Burden on the Right to Vote (On behalf of Plaintiffs Tohono O'odham Nation, Keanu Stevens, Alanna Siquieros, and La Donna Jacket and as to all Defendants)

68. This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a response is required, the Attorney General admits that the Supreme Court's decisions in *Burdick v. Takushi*, 504 U.S. 428 (1992), and *Anderson v. Celebrezze*, 460 U.S. 780 (1983), provide the general framework governing the constitutional challenges Plaintiffs assert against HB 2492. The Attorney General denies any remaining allegations in Paragraph 68.

1	69.	This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a
2	response is	required, the Attorney General admits that the quoted material is accurately
3	reproduced.	
4	70.	This paragraph includes legal conclusions that require no response. If a
5	response is	required, the Attorney General admits that the quoted material is accurately
6	reproduced.	
7	71.	Deny.
8	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES	
9	1.	The Court lacks jurisdiction for lack of standing.
10	2.	Plaintiffs' claims fail because they are not ripe, and thus, not yet fit for judicial
11		review.
12	3.	Plaintiffs fail to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.
13	4.	Plaintiffs fail to meet the requirements for declaratory or preliminary or
14		permanent injunctive relief.
15	WHEREFORE, having fully answered Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint, the Attorney	
16	General respectfully requests that the Court dismiss Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint with	
17	prejudice, deny Plaintiffs' request for injunctive relief, deny Plaintiffs' request for	
18	declaratory relief, order that Plaintiffs take nothing, and award the Attorney General such	
19	other and further relief as the Court deems appropriate.	
20	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL	
21	Pursuant to Rule 38 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the Attorney General	
22	hereby dema	ands a trial by jury in this action of all issues so triable.
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1	DATED this 29th day of March, 2023.
2	KRISTIN K. MAYES ATTORNEY GENERAL
3	ATTORNET GENERAL
4	Ry: s/ Haylaigh S. Crowford
5	By: s/ Hayleigh S. Crawford Hayleigh S. Crawford (No. 032326)
6	Hayleigh S. Crawford (No. 032326) Joshua M. Whitaker (No. 032724) Robert J. Makar (No. 033579)
7	Attorneys for Defendant Attorney General Kristin K. Mayes
8	Autorney General Kristin K. Mayes
9	FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C.
10	
11	By: s/ Emily Ward
12	Douglas C. Northup (No. 013987) Timothy J. Berg (No. 004170) Emily Ward (No. 029963)
13	Emily ward (No. 029963)
14	29026690
15	27020070
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	- 10 -